17 17

Risk characterization of microbiological hazards in food

GUIDELINES





For further information on the joint FAO/WHO activities on microbiological risk assessment, please contact:

Nutrition and Consumer Protection Division Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations Viale delle Terme di Caracalla 00153 Rome, Italy

Fax: +39 06 57054593 E-mail: jemra@fao.org

Web site: http://www.fao.org/ag/agn/agns

or

Department of Food Safety and Zoonoses World Health Organization 20 Avenue Appia CH-1211 Geneva 27 Switzerland

Fax: +41 22 7914807 E-mail: foodsafety@who.int

Web site: http://www.who.int/foodsafety

Cover design: Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations and the World Health Organization

Cover picture: © Dennis Kunkel Microscopy, Inc. MICROBIOLOGICAL RISK ASSESSMENT SERIES



Risk characterization of microbiological hazards in food

GUIDELINES

WORLD HEALTH ORGANIZATION FOOD AND AGRICULTURE ORGANIZATION OF THE UNITED NATIONS

2009

The designations employed and the presentation of material in this information product do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations or of the World Health Organization concerning the legal or development status of any country, territory, city or area or of its authorities, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries. The mention of specific companies or products of manufacturers, whether or not these have been patented, does not imply that these have been endorsed or recommended by FAO or WHO in preference to others of a similar nature that are not mentioned. All reasonable precautions have been taken by the World Health Organization and the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations to verify the information contained in this publication. However, the published material is being distributed without warranty of any kind, either expressed or implied. The responsibility for the interpretation and use of the material lies with the reader. In no event shall the World Health Organization or the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations be liable for damages arising from its use. This report contains the collective views of an international group of experts and does not necessarily represent the decisions or the stated policy of FAO or of WHO.

ISBN 978-92-4-154789-5 (WHO) (NLM classification: QW 85) ISBN 978-92-5-106412-2 (FAO) ISSN 1726-5274

Recommended citation

FAO/WHO [Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations/World Health Organization]. 2009. *Risk Characterization of Microbiological Hazards in Food: Guidelines*. Microbiological Risk Assessment Series No. 17. Rome. 116 pp.

All rights reserved. Reproduction and dissemination of material in this information product for educational or other non-commercial purposes are authorized without any prior written permission from the copyright holders provided the source is fully acknowledged. Reproduction of material in this information product for resale or other commercial purposes is prohibited without written permission of the copyright holders. Applications for such permission should be addressed to the Chief, Electronic Publishing Policy and Support Branch, Communication Division, Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations, Viale delle Terme di Caracalla, 00153 Rome, Italy.

© FAO and WHO 2009

Contents

Acknowledgements	vii
Contributors	ix
Foreword	xi
Abbreviations used in the text	xii
1. INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 FAO/WHO Series of Guidelines on Microbiological Risk Assessm	nent 1
1.2 FAO/WHO Guidelines for Risk Characterization	2
1.2.1 Risk characterization defined	2
1.2.2 Scope	2
1.2.3 Purpose	2
1.2.4 The evolution of microbiological risk assessment	2
1.3 Risk characterization in context	3
1.4 Reading these guidelines	3
2. PURPOSE OF MICROBIOLOGICAL FOOD SAFETY RISK ASSESSMENT	5
2.1 Properties of risk assessments	7
2.1.1 The need for the four components of risk assessment	7
2.1.2 Differentiating risk assessment and risk characterization	8
2.2 Risk characterization measures	8
2.3 Purposes of specific risk assessments	9
2.3.1 Estimating 'unrestricted risk' and 'baseline risk'	10
2.3.2 Comparing risk management strategies	11
2.5.5 Research related study of model	11
2.5 Variability randomnass and uncertainty	14
2.5 Variability	10
2.5.2 Bandomness	17
2.5.3 Uncertainty	17
2.6 Data gaps	18
2.6.1 The use of expert opinion	19
2.7 The role of best- and worst-case scenarios	20
2.8 Assessing the reliability of the results the risk assessment	21
3. QUALITATIVE RISK CHARACTERIZATION IN RISK ASSESSMENT	23
3.1 Introduction	23
3.1.1 The value and uses of qualitative risk assessment	24
3.1.2 Qualitative risk assessment in food safety	25
3.2 Characteristics of a qualitative risk assessment	26

3.2.1 The complementary nature	of qualitative and quantitative risk assessments	26
3.2.2 Subjective nature of textual	conclusions in qualitative risk assessments	26
3.2.3 Limitations of qualitative risl	c characterization	27
3.3 Performing a qualitative ris	sk characterization	29
3.3.1 Describing the risk pathway		29
3.3.2 Data requirements		29
3.3.3 Dealing with uncertainty and	d variability	29
3.3.4 Transparency in reaching co	onclusions	30
3.4 Examples of qualitative ris	k assessment	32
3.4.1 WHO faecal pollution and w	rater quality	32
3.4.2 Australian Drinking Water G	auidelines	33
3.4.3 EFSA BSE/TSE risk assess	ment of goat milk and milk-derived products	33
3.4.4 Geographical BSE cattle ris	k assessment	34
4. SEMI-QUANTITATIVE RISK CHARA	CTERIZATION	37
4.1 Introduction		37
4.1.1 Uses of semi-quantitative ris	sk assessment	37
4.2 Characteristics of a semi-	uantitative risk assessment	38
4.3 Performing a semi-quantita	ative risk assessment	40
4.3.1 Risks with several impact di	mensions	41
4.3.2 Comparing risks and risk m	anagement strategies	42
4.3.3 Limitations of semi-quantita	tive risk assessment	43
4.3.4 Dealing with uncertainty and	d variability	45
4.3.5 Data requirements		45
4.3.6 Transparency in reaching co	onclusions	46
4.4 Examples of semi-quantita	tive risk assessment	46
4.4.1 New Zealand risk profile of	<i>Mycobacterium bovis</i> in milk	46
4.4.2 Seafood safety using RiskR	anger	48
4.4.3 Australia's animal and anim	al product import-risk assessment methodology	50
5. QUANTITATIVE RISK CHARACTER	IZATION	53
5.1 Introduction		53
5.2 Quantitative measures		53
5.2.1 Measure of probability		54
5.2.2 Measure of impact		54
5.2.3 Measures of risk		54
5.2.4 Matching dose-response en	dpoints to the risk measure	57
5.2.5 Accounting for subpopulation	ns	58
5.3 Desirable properties of qua	antitative risk assessments	58
5.4 Variability, randomness ar	d uncertainty	59
5.4.1 Modelling variability as rand	lomness	59
5.4.2 Separation of variability and	randomness from uncertainty	60

— iv —

5.5 Integration of hazard characterization and exposure assessment	61
5.5.1 Units of dose in exposure assessment	61
5.5.2 Units of dose and response in dose-response assessment	62
5.5.3 Combining Exposure and Dose-response assessments	63
5.5.4 Dose-response model assumptions	64
5.5.5 Exposure expressed as prevalence	65
5.5.6 Epidemiological-based dose-response relationships	66
5.5.7 Integration of variability and uncertainty	67
5.6 Examples of quantitative risk analysis	74
5.6.1 FSIS E. coli comparative risk assessment for intact (non-tenderized) and non- intact (tenderized) beef	74
5.6.2 FAO/WHO Listeria monocytogenes in ready-to-eat foods	74
5.6.3 Shiga-toxin-producing E. coli O157 in steak tartare patties	75
5.6.4 FAO/WHO risk assessment of Vibrio vulnificus in raw oysters.	76
6. QUALITY ASSURANCE	79
6.1 Data quality assurance	79
6.1.1 Data collection	79
6.1.2 Sorting and selecting data sources	82
6.2 Progression and weight of evidence	82
6.3 Sensitivity analysis	83
6.3.1 Sensitivity analysis in qualitative risk assessment	84
6.3.2 Sensitivity analysis in quantitative risk assessment	84
6.4 Uncertainty analysis	86
6.5 Model verification	88
6.6 Model anchoring	87
6.7 Model validation	87
6.8 Comparison with epidemiological data	88
6.9 Extrapolation and robustness	89
6.10 Credibility of the risk assessment	90
6.10.1 Risk assessment documentation	90
6.10.2 Peer review	91
7. LINKING RISK ASSESSMENT AND ECONOMIC ANALYSIS	93
7.1 Introduction	93
7.2 Economic valuation issues	94
7.2.1 Valuation of health outcomes	94
7.2.2 Valuation of non-health outcomes	96
7.3 Integrating economics into risk assessments to aid decision-	
making	97
7.3.1 Cost-benefit analysis	98
7.3.2 Cost effectiveness analysis	98

— v —

7.3.3 Risk-cost trade-off curves	99
7.3.4 Uncertainty in economic analysis	99
8. RISK COMMUNICATION ASPECTS OF RISK CHARACTERIZATION	101
8.1 Introduction	101
8.1.1 Information to share with stakeholders	102
8.1.2 Major scientific issues in risk communication	102
8.2 Interaction between risk managers and risk assessors	102
8.2.1 Planning and commissioning an MRA	103
8.2.2 During the MRA	103
8.3 After the completion of the MRA	104
8.4 Development of risk communication strategies	105
8.5 Public review	108
REFERENCES CITED IN THE TEXT	109
APPENDIX 1	115

— vi —



https://www.yunbaogao.cn/report/index/report?reportId=5_29198

