

Correlates of vaccine-induced protection: methods and implications

Immunization, Vaccines and Biologicals



**World Health
Organization**

Correlates of vaccine-induced protection: methods and implications

Immunization, Vaccines and Biologicals



**World Health
Organization**

**The Department of Immunization, Vaccines and Biologicals
thanks the donors whose unspecified financial support
has made the production of this document possible.**

This document was published by the
Initiative for Vaccine Research (IVR)
of the Department of Immunization, Vaccines and Biologicals

Ordering code: WHO/IVB/13.01
Printed: May 2013

This publication is available on the Internet at:
www.who.int/vaccines-documents/

**Copies of this document as well as additional materials on
immunization, vaccines and biologicals may be requested from:**

World Health Organization
Department of Immunization, Vaccines and Biologicals
CH-1211 Geneva 27, Switzerland

• *Fax:* + 41 22 791 4227 • *Email:* vaccines@who.int •

© World Health Organization 2013

All rights reserved. Publications of the World Health Organization can be obtained from WHO Press, World Health Organization, 20 Avenue Appia, 1211 Geneva 27, Switzerland (tel: +41 22 791 3264; fax: +41 22 791 4857; email: bookorders@who.int). Requests for permission to reproduce or translate WHO publications – whether for sale or for noncommercial distribution – should be addressed to WHO Press, at the above address (fax: +41 22 791 4806; email: permissions@who.int).

The designations employed and the presentation of the material in this publication do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the World Health Organization concerning the legal status of any country, territory, city or area or of its authorities, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries. Dotted lines on maps represent approximate border lines for which there may not yet be full agreement.

The mention of specific companies or of certain manufacturers' products does not imply that they are endorsed or recommended by the World Health Organization in preference to others of a similar nature that are not mentioned. Errors and omissions excepted, the names of proprietary products are distinguished by initial capital letters.

All reasonable precautions have been taken by the World Health Organization to verify the information contained in this publication. However, the published material is being distributed without warranty of any kind, either expressed or implied. The responsibility for the interpretation and use of the material lies with the reader. In no event shall the World Health Organization be liable for damages arising from its use.

The named authors alone are responsible for the views expressed in this publication.

Printed by the WHO Document Production Services, Geneva, Switzerland

Contents

| | |
|---|------------|
| <i>Acknowledgements</i> | <i>v</i> |
| <i>Abbreviations and Acronyms</i> | <i>vii</i> |
| 1. Introduction | 1 |
| 1.1 <i>Definitions</i> | 1 |
| 1.1.1 Correlates and surrogates | 2 |
| 1.1.2 Protection | 3 |
| 2. Implications of different immunological mechanisms | 5 |
| 2.1 <i>Single pathway with one immune marker</i> | 5 |
| 2.2 <i>Two or more immune markers</i> | 5 |
| 3. Study designs to evaluate vaccine-induced substitute endpoints | 9 |
| 3.1 <i>Trials and other experimental designs</i> | 9 |
| 3.1.1 Randomized controlled trials with clinical endpoints | 9 |
| 3.1.2 Immunogenicity studies..... | 11 |
| 3.1.3 Passive immunization studies | 12 |
| 3.1.4 Challenge studies | 13 |
| 3.2 <i>Observational studies</i> | 13 |
| 3.2.1 Cohort studies | 13 |
| 3.2.2 Natural history studies | 14 |
| 3.2.3 Maternal–newborn studies | 14 |
| 3.2.4 Case–control studies | 15 |
| 3.2.5 Ecological studies | 15 |
| 4. Statistical methods for evaluation of substitute endpoints | 17 |
| 4.1 <i>General methods for validating immunological markers as substitute endpoints for clinical protection</i> | 17 |
| 4.1.1 The Prentice criteria | 17 |
| 4.1.2 Proportion of treatment effect | 19 |
| 4.1.3 The Qin framework | 20 |
| 4.2 <i>Methods for relating vaccine efficacy to measured levels of vaccine-induced immune markers</i> | 21 |
| 4.2.1 Distribution of antibody titres and their implications | 21 |
| 4.2.2 Threshold methods | 23 |
| 4.2.3 Continuous method | 26 |
| 4.2.4 Summary | 27 |

| | |
|---|-----------|
| 5. Other issues related to immunological markers for protection..... | 29 |
| 5.1 <i>Endpoint definition</i> | 29 |
| 5.2 <i>Exposure intensity/challenge dose</i> | 29 |
| 5.3 <i>Host factors</i> | 31 |
| 5.3.1 Age..... | 31 |
| 5.3.2 Socioeconomic status | 32 |
| 5.3.3 Environmental factors | 32 |
| 5.4 <i>Antigen factors</i> | 32 |
| 5.5 <i>Immunological factors</i> | 33 |
| 5.5.1 Type of antibody | 33 |
| 5.5.2 Kinetics of the immune response | 34 |
| 5.6 <i>Measurement error and noise</i> | 35 |
| 6. Putting it together – the relationship between immunological markers and vaccine performance in the field | 37 |
| 6.1 <i>Interpretation of vaccine-induced protection: ‘all-or-none’ versus ‘partial’ models</i> | 37 |
| 6.1.1 All-or-none model of action | 37 |
| 6.1.2 Partial (‘leaky’) models | 39 |
| 6.1.3 Summary | 41 |
| 7. Conclusions | 43 |
| Annex 1: Correlate and surrogate terminology | 45 |
| References | 49 |

Acknowledgements

This report was commissioned by the Initiative for Vaccine Research and prepared by P. Nguipdop Djomo, S.L. Thomas and P.E.M. Fine, Department of Infectious Disease Epidemiology, London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine, London, United Kingdom. The contributions of N. Andrews, K. Fielding, U. Fruth, A. Hall, A.-M. Henao-Restrepo, P. Phillips, L. Rodrigues, S. Scott and P. Smith are gratefully acknowledged.

Abbreviations and Acronyms

| | |
|---------------|--|
| BCG | Bacillus Calmette-Guerin (tuberculosis vaccine) |
| CFU | colony forming units |
| CI | (95% CI) confidence interval |
| CMI | cell-mediated immunity |
| CoR | correlate of risk (Qin et al. terminology) |
| E-IPV | enhanced inactivated polio vaccine |
| ELISA | enzyme-linked immunosorbent assay |
| EMA | European Agency for the Evaluation of Medicinal Products |
| EPI | Expanded Programme on Immunization |
| FDA | Food and Drug Administration (USA) |
| FHA | filamentous haemagglutinin (<i>B. pertussis</i> antigen) |
| FIM | fimbriae (e.g. of <i>B. pertussis</i>) |
| GMC | geometric mean concentration |
| GMT | geometric mean titre |
| HbOC | <i>Haemophilus influenzae</i> type b oligosaccharide conjugate vaccine |
| HI | haemagglutination inhibition |
| Hib | <i>Haemophilus influenzae</i> type b |
| ICC | Intraclass correlation coefficient |
| ICH | International Conference on Harmonization |
| IFN- γ | Interferon gamma |

预览已结束，完整报告链接和二维码如下：

https://www.yunbaogao.cn/report/index/report?reportId=5_28161

