## Joint FAO/WHO Expert Committee on Food Additives (JECFA)

Guidance document for WHO monographers and reviewers evaluating food additives

(excluding enzyme preparations and flavouring agents)



## Joint FAO/WHO Expert Committee on Food Additives (JECFA)

# Guidance document for WHO monographers and reviewers evaluating <u>food additives</u>

(excluding enzyme preparations and flavouring agents)

**Version 1.0** 

February 2016

Geneva



#### WHO Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data

Guidance document for WHO monographers and reviewers evaluating food additives (excluding enzyme preparations and flavouring agents), version 1.0.

1.Food Additives. 2.Risk Assessment. 3.Meta-Analysis as Topic. 4.Review. I.Joint FAO/WHO Expert Committee on Food Additives (JECFA). II.World Health Organization.

ISBN 978 92 4 151579 5 (NLM classification: WA 712)

This publication was originally published under ISBN 978 92 4 151039 4

#### © World Health Organization 2016

All rights reserved. Publications of the World Health Organization are available on the WHO website (<a href="http://www.who.int">http://www.who.int</a>) or can be purchased from WHO Press, World Health Organization, 20 Avenue Appia, 1211 Geneva 27, Switzerland (tel.: +41 22 791 3264; fax: +41 22 791 4857; email: <a href="mailto:bookorders@who.int">bookorders@who.int</a>).

Requests for permission to reproduce or translate WHO publications –whether for sale or for non-commercial distribution– should be addressed to WHO Press through the WHO website (<a href="http://www.who.int/about/licensing/copyright">http://www.who.int/about/licensing/copyright</a> form/index.html).

The designations employed and the presentation of the material in this publication do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the World Health Organization concerning the legal status of any country, territory, city or area or of its authorities, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries. Dotted and dashed lines on maps represent approximate border lines for which there may not yet be full agreement.

The mention of specific companies or of certain manufacturers' products does not imply that they are endorsed or recommended by the World Health Organization in preference to others of a similar nature that are not mentioned. Errors and omissions excepted, the names of proprietary products are distinguished by initial capital letters.

All reasonable precautions have been taken by the World Health Organization to verify the information contained in this publication. However, the published material is being distributed without warranty of any kind, either expressed or implied. The responsibility for the interpretation and use of the material lies with the reader. In no event shall the World Health Organization be liable for damages arising from its use.

#### **Table of contents**

List of abbreviations	V
Preface	vi
Chapter 1: Roles and responsibilities	1
1.1 Selection of compounds on the agenda and issuing the call for data	
1.2 Identification of monographers and reviewers and assignment of compounds and tasks	
1.3 Dealing with the data submission	
1.4 Handling contacts with the sponsor	
1.5 Performing literature searches	
1.6 Evaluating the data	
1.8 Preparing the report item and finalizing the monograph at the meeting	
Chapter 2: Preparing the monograph	7
2.1 Introduction	
2.2 General aspects	
2.2.1 Formatting	
2.2.2 Units of measurement	
2.2.3 Presentation of doses	
2.2.4 Presentation of point of departure	
2.2.5 Tables	
2.2.6 Historical control data	
2.2.7 In-text references	
2.2.8 Miscellaneous	
2.3 Detailed content of the monograph	
2.3.1 Explanation	
2.3.2 Biological data	
2.3.3 Dietary exposure	
2.3.4 Comments	
2.3.5 Evaluation	
2.3.6 References	
Chapter 3: Preparing the report item	28
Chapter 4: Additional considerations	29
4.1 Re-evaluation of food additives by JECFA	29
4.2 Commentary on the use of NOEL/NOAEL and LOEL/LOAEL	29
4.3 Overall NOAEL	29
4.4 Health-based guidance values for food additives	30
4.4.1 Acceptable daily intake (ADI)	
4.4.2 ADI "not specified"	30
4.4.3 Temporary ADI and ADI "not specified"	30
4.4.4 Group ADIs	
4.4.5 Substances that are genotoxic and carcinogenic	31
4.4.6 Acute reference dose (ARfD)	
4.5 Extension of an existing ADI to substances obtained from different sources and/or by	
different manufacturing processes	31
4.6 The use of the margin of exposure (MOE) for the evaluation of additives used in infant	
formulas	32
References	34
Annex 1: Template for monograph	35
Annex 2: Examples of table formats	
Annex 3: Template for report item	
Annex 4: Example of report item	43

#### List of abbreviations

ADI acceptable daily intake
ARfD acute reference dose

BMDL<sub>x</sub> lower 95% confidence limit on the benchmark dose for an x% response

bw body weight

CCFA Codex Committee on Food Additives
CD-ROM compact disc read-only memory

DVD digital video disc

EHC Environmental Health Criteria

FAO Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations

GLP good laboratory practice

JECFA Joint FAO/WHO Expert Committee on Food Additives
JMPR Joint FAO/WHO Meeting on Pesticide Residues

LC<sub>50</sub> median lethal concentration

LD<sub>50</sub> median lethal dose

LOAEL lowest-observed-adverse-effect level

LOEL lowest-observed-effect level

NHANES National Health and Nutrition Examination Survey (USA)

NOAEL no-observed-adverse-effect level

NOEL no-observed-effect level OCR optical character recognition

OECD Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development

PDF portable document format

POD point of departure ppm part per million QA quality assurance

SI Le Système international d'unités (International System of Units)

URL uniform resource locator
USA United States of America
USB universal serial bus

WHO World Health Organization

#### **Preface**

This guidance document replaces the previous guidance for the safety evaluation of food additives by Joint FAO/WHO Expert Committee on Food Additives (JECFA) monographers and reviewers, issued by WHO in 2000. It is intended primarily for WHO Experts (monographers) who prepare monographs for JECFA and for Members (reviewers) who have been assigned to peer review them. The guidance will also be useful to manufacturers who submit dossiers to WHO and other parties interested in understanding the process followed in the evaluation of food additives by JECFA. Detailed scientific guidance on the interpretation of toxicological and epidemiological data may be found in the monograph Environmental Health Criteria 240 (http://www.who.int/foodsafety/publications/chemicalfood/en/).

In this guidance document, reference to JECFA is to JECFA (food additives and contaminants).

With the aim of harmonizing the work of JECFA with that of the Joint FAO/WHO Meeting on Pesticide Residues (JMPR), this guidance document takes into account the document entitled *Guidance document for WHO monographers and reviewers*, prepared by JMPR in 2015 (http://www.who.int/foodsafety/publications/jmpr\_guidance\_document\_1.pdf?ua=1). The authors of the JMPR guidance document as well as the authors of this guidance document for the evaluation of food additives are gratefully acknowledged.

It is envisioned that this guidance document will be modified based upon comments received and experience gained in using it. Comments on this guidance document and suggestions for future editions will be gladly accepted by the WHO Joint Secretary, Joint FAO/WHO Expert Committee on Food Additives, World Health Organization, 1211 Geneva 27, Switzerland, at jecfa@who.int.

Separate guidance documents for the evaluation of enzyme preparations and flavouring agents and for the assessment of dietary exposure to food additives are also available on the WHO website (http://www.who.int/foodsafety/chem/jecfa/quidelines/en/).

#### **Chapter 1: Roles and responsibilities**

The roles and responsibilities of the JECFA Secretariat and of both monographers ("Experts") and reviewers ("Members"), from the time they are assigned to their compounds through to the post-meeting finalization of their monographs, are outlined below.

#### 1.1 Selection of compounds on the agenda and issuing the call for data

The compounds on the agenda for the next JECFA meeting on food additives are selected on the basis of a priority list established by the Codex Committee on Food Additives, requests by FAO and WHO and their Member States, and recommendations of earlier meetings of JECFA. The WHO and FAO Joint Secretaries post a call for data on the compounds on the agenda 10–12 months in advance of the meeting on the Internet, utilizing as broad a distribution as possible. The deadline for submission of data is ordinarily 6–7 months before the meeting.

### 1.2 Identification of monographers and reviewers and assignment of compounds and tasks

The WHO Joint Secretary will contact potential monographers and reviewers within the existing roster of experts about their interest and availability to serve as experts for the next meeting of JECFA on food additives. Participants are invited as independent experts in their respective areas, and they do not represent any organization or government. Participation is not compensated, although WHO is responsible for return airfare and provides a daily subsistence allowance to cover accommodation, meals and other miscellaneous expenses.

In accordance with WHO rules and procedures for declarations of interest, <sup>2</sup> any potential or perceived interests will be evaluated before any tasks are assigned. In the interest of transparency and to avoid potential conflicts, participants are encouraged to be inclusive in the declaration of interests. It is important to note that the focus should be on a comprehensive declaration of all interests, not just those perceived by the participant as potentially posing conflicts. In accordance with WHO procedures, declarations of interest are not published, but potential conflicts of interest that preclude participation in discussions on particular compounds are noted in the meeting report. The WHO Joint Secretary will take into account whether monographers have been involved with a particular compound, which may be perceived as a conflict or bias. Interests to be considered include the following examples:

- Monographers have worked for or have an interest in the sponsoring company.
- Monographers have performed some of the studies to be evaluated.
- Monographers have recently been closely involved with preparing an evaluation of a compound for a national or supranational body.

The last point is important as, although familiarity with a compound and the supporting data can make preparation of the monograph easier, there might be the perception that the JECFA evaluation is not entirely independent of the previous evaluation.

According to WHO rules and procedures,<sup>3</sup> expert meetings are private in nature, and participation is by invitation only. The data used and discussions held before, during and after the meeting on the subject matter of the meeting are to be held in strict confidence. Discussions held subsequent to the meeting with non-participants should be limited to the public information made available in the monographs and meeting report.

#### 1.3 Dealing with the data submission

After a compound has been assigned to a monographer and a reviewer, the Secretariat will ensure that the sponsoring company arranges submission of the dossier, which contains the original study reports, relevant papers from the literature and the company overview (summary of the submitted

1

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Previously Temporary Advisers.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> http://www.who.int/about/declaration-of-interests/en/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> http://apps.who.int/gb/bd/PDF/bd48/basic-documents-48th-edition-en.pdf#page=127

data). As a good practice, the sponsoring company is asked to alert the monographer, the reviewer and the WHO Joint Secretary when the data have been sent. Normally, the data are submitted as searchable PDF files on a suitably indexed CD-ROM, DVD or USB stick. A table of contents using fully descriptive file names needs to be submitted with each electronic submission; for example, a title of "xyz 33564-05" is not going to help the monographer locate a 90-day dog study by Jones et al. (2001). Sponsoring companies should submit editable PDFs whenever possible; when documents are scanned, these should be converted using OCR to editable format, if at all possible. This facilitates the accurate transfer of information to the monograph. Companies should be aware that, owing to the workload of experts reviewing the dossiers, delay of a submission may cause the compound to be removed from the JECFA agenda.

When the data are received, it is important for the monographer to confirm receipt to the sponsor and the WHO Joint Secretary. If the data submission has not arrived in a reasonable length of time, the monographer should contact the sponsor and the WHO Joint Secretary, as it is not unknown for items to go missing in transit. On opening the package, it is recommended that the monographer perform some basic checks on the quality and usability of the documentation:

- For electronic submissions
  - o Do the document files open properly?
  - Are a table of contents and an appropriate index provided?
  - o Are the files searchable?
  - o Are the pages legible, especially older study reports that have been scanned?
  - o Are the titles of the files helpful?
- Check the company overview
  - o Is it in the JECFA style and in a suitable format (PDF and/or Microsoft Word) to permit the use of text or tables for the monograph?
  - Does it contain a reference list in the JECFA style (see section 2.3.5)?

If the monographer identifies any issues with the data submission where it is believed that the sponsor could provide an improved submission, then the monographer should inform the WHO Joint Secretary, who will contact the sponsor with a detailed request for what is needed. It is in the sponsor's interest to provide a usable submission. If the monographer cannot read data in a key study report, this might prevent the establishment of a health-based guidance value.

Unpublished confidential studies that are submitted will be safeguarded and will be used only for evaluation purposes by JECFA. Summaries of the confidential studies will be published by FAO and WHO after the meetings in the form of specifications and toxicological monographs.

Submitted confidential data can be either returned to submitters at their expense or destroyed after the evaluations have been completed. Key material can be stored by WHO for up to five years and then destroyed.

#### 1.4 Handling contacts with the sponsor

To ensure transparency, it is important that all contacts between the monographer and the sponsor are documented and copied to the WHO Joint Secretary. With respect to contact with the sponsor:

预览已结束,完整报告链接和二维码如下:

https://www.yunbaogao.cn/report/index/report?reportId=5\_26994

