

Evaluation of the Sustainable Neighbourhood Programme in Mavoko Municipality, Kenya



FEBRUARY 2012

Evaluation of the Sustainable Neighbourhood Programme in Mavoko Municipality, Kenya

FEBRUARY 2012

UN  HABITAT



Evaluation Report 4/2012

Evaluation of the Sustainable Neighbourhood Programme in Mavoko
Municipality, Kenya

This report is available from <http://www.unhabitat.org/evaluations>

First published in Nairobi in December 2012 by UN-Habitat.

Copyright © United Nations Human Settlements Programme 2012

Produced by the Evaluation Unit

United Nations Human Settlements Programme (UN-Habitat)

P. O. Box 30030, 00100 Nairobi GPO KENYA

Tel: 254-020-7623120 (Central Office)

www.unhabitat.org

HS:HS/003/14E

DISCLAIMER

The designations employed and the presentation of the material in this publication do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the Secretariat of the United Nations concerning the legal status of any country, territory, city or area or of its authorities, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries.

Views expressed in this publication do not necessarily reflect those of the United Nations Human Settlements Programme, the United Nations, or its Member States.

Excerpts may be reproduced without authorization, on condition that the source is indicated.

Front Cover: Photographs of Mavoko Municipality © UN-Habitat

Acknowledgements

Author: Kathleen Webb

Editor: Edward Miller

Design & Layout: Phyllis Githua

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS	V
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	VI
i Introduction	vi
ii Methodology	vii
iii Key Findings and Assessment of the Programme	vii
iv Conclusions	xiii
v Lessons Learned	xiv
vi Recommendations	xv
1. INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 Background	1
1.2 Objective, Purpose, and Scope of the Evaluation	3
1.3 Outline of the Report	3
2. OVERVIEW OF THE SUSTAINABLE NEIGHBOURHOOD PROGRAMME	4
2.1. Overview of The Sustainable Neighbourhood Programme for the Period August 2002 to April 2011	4
2.2. Overview of The Sustainable Neighbourhood Programme for the Period April 2011 to January 2012	9
3. EVALUATION PROFILE AND METHODOLOGY	10
4. EVALUATION FINDINGS AND ASSESSMENT	11
4.1 Achievements	11
4.2 Assessment of Relevance	15
4.3 Assessment of Effectiveness	17
4.4 Assessment of Efficiency	19
4.5 Assessment of Cross-Cutting Issues	22
5. CONCLUSIONS, LESSONS LEARNED AND RECOMMENDATIONS	26
5.1 Conclusions	26
5.2 Lessons Learned	28
5.3 Recommendations	29
5. ANNEXES	
Annex I: Terms of Reference	31
Annex II: Bibliography	38

Annex III: List Of People Interviewed	45
Annex IV: Detailed methodology and revised evaluation work plan	48
Annex V: Evaluation Questionnaires	53
Annex VI: Sustainable Neighbourhood Programme Nairobi Plot Project (Budget Implementation Phase)	60
Annex VII: Sustainable Neighbourhood Programme—Nairobi Financial Report as at 31 December 2008	62
Annex VIII: Sustainable Neighbourhood Programme Timeline	64
Annex IX: Implementation Schedule (No-Cost Extension)	65

LIST OF FIGURES AND TABLES

Figure 1.1: UN-Habitat Proposed Subdivision of L.R. No. 27664 (28/06/2010)	2
Table 2.1: Activity Status, December 2004	7
Table 4.1: Summary of Findings of the Evaluator with Respect to the Achievement of the Four Immediate Outcome Objectives	13
Table 4.2: Planning Requirements for Housing	15

ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS

CBO	Community-based organization
CTA	Chief Technical Adviser
EUR	Euro
GROOTS	Grassroots Organizations Operating Together in Sisterhood
KENSUP	Kenya Slum Upgrading Programme
KES	Kenya shilling
KEWLAT	Kenya Women Land Access Trust
MOU	Memorandum of Understanding
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
ROAAS	Regional Office for Africa and the Arab States
RTCD	Regional Technical Cooperation Division
SNP	Sustainable Neighbourhood Programme
TOR	Terms of Reference
UN	United Nations
UN-Habitat	United Nations Human Settlements Programme
USD	United States Dollar
YEP	Youth Empowerment Programme

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

I. INTRODUCTION

The Sustainable Neighbourhood Programme (SNP) was designed as a 27-month, experimental, community-driven slum resettlement¹ project, expected to address the housing crisis in Kenya by focusing on improving the lives and livelihoods of people living in 26 slum settlements in Mavoko, Kenya.²

A 55-acre³ piece of land in Mavoko Municipality⁴ was provided for the project by the Government of Kenya through a debt swap with the Government of Finland, and the SNP was then to be implemented from August 2002 to April 2005. The Kenya Slum Upgrading Programme (KENSUP), a secretariat body within the Ministry of Housing mandated to upgrade slums in

Kenya, would lead project implementation with funding provided by the Government of Finland (EUR 750,000) and the United Nations Human Settlements Programme (UN-Habitat) in kind (USD 160,000).

After an impasse, a new development process for the SNP was initiated in April 2011, to be implemented in collaboration with the Government of Kenya and other stakeholders. At the time of the evaluation, the new development process had started (Phase 1) and was in the process of determining the feasibility and possible redesign of the project.

This evaluation was a response to a request by the Government of Finland for a final evaluation of the achievements, experiences, challenges, and lessons learned. The end-of-project evaluation of the programme was carried out between 1 December 2011 and 31 January 2012 by an independent consultant, Ms. Kathleen Webb. The Regional Office of Africa and the Arab States (Kenya Unit) managed the evaluation, with technical support from the Evaluation Unit. The purpose of the evaluation was to assess the extent to which the development objective and immediate outcome objectives of the SNP were achieved between 2002 and 2011.

¹ The terms 'resettlement' and 'relocation' are used interchangeably in this document and have a similar meaning: slum dwellers moving to an improved location.

² The 26 slum settlements included 25 Mavoko slum settlements and one additional site that housed those working in Athi River but living in Kibera slums. See *Situation Analysis and Evaluation Report population estimates (UN-Habitat Progress Report, 2004, page 2)*, which estimated the Mavoko slum population at 26,000 persons living in 25 slum settlements. There was no population estimate for the Kibera slum settlement.

³ 55 acres = 22.21 hectares

⁴ The Government of Kenya allocated 55 acres of land for the UN-Habitat SNP project through a debt swap with the Government of Finland. The land is registered as L.R. 27664, with the title granted on 22 June 2009. The site is about 30 km from Nairobi, the capital of Kenya.

