UNITED NATIONS CONFERENCE ON TRADE AND DEVELOPMENT

TAKING OF PROPERTY

UNCTAD Series on issues in international investment agreements



NOTE

UNCTAD serves as the focal point within the United Nations Secretariat for all matters related to foreign direct investment and transnational corporations. In the past, the Programme on Transnational Corporations was carried out by the United Nations Centre on Transnational Corporations (1975-1992) and the Transnational Corporations and Management Division of the United Nations Department of Economic and Social Development (1992-1993). In 1993, the Programme was transferred to the United Nations Conference on Trade and Development. UNCTAD seeks to further the understanding of the nature of transnational corporations and their contribution to development and to create an enabling environment for international investment and enterprise development. UNCTAD's work is carried out through intergovernmental deliberations, research and analysis, technical assistance activities, seminars, workshops and conferences.

The term "country" as used in this study also refers, as appropriate, to territories or areas; the designations employed and the presentation of the material do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the Secretariat of the United Nations concerning the legal status of any country, territory, city or area or of its authorities, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries. In addition, the designations of country groups are intended solely for statistical or analytical convenience and do not necessarily express a judgement about the stage of development reached by a particular country or area in the development process.

The following symbols have been used in the tables:

Two dots (...) indicate that data are not available or are not separately reported. Rows in tables have been omitted in those cases where no data are available for any of the elements in the row;

A dash (-) indicates that the item is equal to zero or its value is negligible;

A blank in a table indicates that the item is not applicable;

A slash (/) between dates representing years, e.g. 1994/95, indicates a financial year;

Use of a hyphen (-) between dates representing years, e.g. 1994-1995, signifies the full period involved, including the beginning and end years.

Reference to "dollars" (\$) means United States dollars, unless otherwise indicated.

Annual rates of growth or change, unless otherwise stated, refer to annual compound rates.

Details and percentages in tables do not necessarily add to totals because of rounding.

The material contained in this study may be freely quoted with appropriate acknowledgement.

UNCTAD/ITE/IIT/15

UNITED NATIONS PUBLICATION
Sales No. E.00.II.D.4
ISBN 92-1-112471-9

Copyright © United Nations, 2000 All rights reserved

IIA Issues Paper Series

The main purpose of the UNCTAD Series on issues in international investment agreements is to address key concepts and issues relevant to international investment agreements and to present them in a manner that is easily accessible to end-users. The series covers the following topics:

Admission and establishment

Competition

Dispute settlement (investor-State)

Dispute settlement (State-State)

Employment

Environment

Fair and equitable treatment

Foreign direct investment and development

Funds transfer

Home country measures

Host country operational measures

Illicit payments

Incentives

Investment-related trade measures

Lessons from the Uruguay Round

Lessons from the MAI

Modalities and implementation issues

Most-favoured-nation treatment

National treatment

Trends in international investment agreements: an overview

Scope and definition

Social responsibility

State contracts

Taking of property

Taxation

Transfer of technology

Transfer pricing

Transparency

Trends in international investment agreements: an overview

Preface

The United Nations Conference on Trade and Development (UNCTAD) is implementing a work programme on a possible multilateral framework on investment, with a view towards assisting developing countries to participate as effectively as possible in international investment rule-making at the bilateral, regional, plurilateral and multilateral levels. The programme embraces capacity-building seminars, regional symposia, training courses, dialogues between negotiators and groups of civil society and the preparation of a series of issues papers.

This paper is part of that series. It is addressed to government officials, corporate executives, representatives of non-governmental organizations, officials of international agencies and researchers. The series seeks to provide balanced analyses of issues that may arise in discussions about international investment agreements. Each study may be read by itself, independently of the others. Since, however, the issues treated closely interact with one another, the studies pay particular attention to such interactions.

The series is produced by a team led by Karl P. Sauvant and Pedro Roffe. The principal officer responsible for its production is John Gara who oversees the development of the papers at various stages. The members of the team include S.M. Bushehri, Obiajulu Ihonor and Jörg Weber. The series' principal advisors are Arghyrios A. Fatouros, Sanjaya Lall and Peter T. Muchlinski. The present paper is based on a manuscript prepared by M. Sornarajah. The final version reflects comments received from Joachim Karl, Nick Mabey and Marinus Sikkel. The paper was desktop-published by Teresita Sabico.

Geneva, January 2000

Rubens Ricupero Secretary-General of UNCTAD

Acknowledgments

UNCTAD's work programme on a possible multilateral framework on investment is implemented by a team of UNCTAD staff members and consultants headed by Karl P. Sauvant and Pedro Roffe and including Marianela Bruno-Pollero, S.M. Bushehri, Arghyrios A. Fatouros, John Gara, Obiajulu Ihonor, Anna Joubin-Bret, Sanjaya Lall, Patricia Mira, Peter T. Muchlinski, Miguel Rodriguez, Christina Stachowiak and Jörg Weber. Administrative support is provided by Helene Dufays and Antonia Künzel.

UNCTAD has carried out a number of activities related to the work programme in cooperation with other intergovernmental organizations, including the Secretariat of the Andean Community, La Francophonie, the Inter-Arab Investment Guarantee Corporation, the League of Arab States, the Organization of American States, and the World Trade Organization. UNCTAD has also cooperated with non-governmental organizations, including the Centro de Estudios Interdisciplinarios de Derecho Industrial y Económico - Universidad de Buenos Aires, the Consumer Unity and Trust Society - India, the Economic Research Forum - Cairo, the European Roundtable of Industrialists, the Friedrich Ebert Foundation, the International Confederation of Free Trade Unions, Oxfam, SOMO - Centre for Research on Multinational Corporations, the Third World Network, Universidad del Pacifico, University of the West Indies, and World Wildlife Fund International.

Funds for the work programme have so far been received from Australia, Brazil, Canada, France, the Netherlands, Norway, Switzerland, the United Kingdom and the European Commission. Countries such as China, Egypt, Guatemala, India, Jamaica, Morocco, Peru, Sri Lanka and Venezuela have also contributed to the work programme by hosting regional symposia. All of these contributions are gratefully acknowledged.

Table of contents

			Page
Pref	ace .		iv
Ack	now	ledgements	v
Exec	cutiv	ve summary	1
INT	RO	DUCTION	3
I.	EX	PLANATION OF THE ISSUE	11
	Α.	Categories of takings	. 11
	B.	Requirements for a lawful taking	. 12
		 Public purpose	13 13
II.	ST	OCKTAKING AND ANALYSIS	19
	Α.	What amounts to a taking?	. 19
	B.	Provisions on requirements for the legality of takings	. 24
		 Public purpose	25 26

		I	Page	
III.		TERACTION WITH OTHER ISSUES AND NCEPTS	35	
	DE	NCLUSION: ECONOMIC AND VELOPMENT IMPLICATIONS AND LICY OPTIONS	41	
	A.	Defining a taking: policy options	42	
		1. A comprehensive definition	42	
		2. A narrow definition	43	
		3. Interpretative definition	43	
		4. Carve-out provisions	44	
		5. International reviews	45	
	B.	Standard of compensation: policy options	45	
		1. Determination of the value of compensation	46	
		2. Limitation on the time frame within	47	
		which payment is ade	47 47	
		3. Type of currency in which payment is made4. Transferability of compensation paid	48	
	C.	Drafting models	48	
		1. High protection for investment model	49	
		2. High host country discretion model	50	
		3. Intermediate model	51	
Refe	ren	ces	55	
Sele		UNCTAD publications on transnational porations and foreign direct investment	61	
Questionnaire				

Page

Boxes

1.	Regulatory measures and depreciation in					
	value: the Ethyl case	7				
2.	Examples of creeping expropriation	12				
3.	Examples of takings in Canadian IIAs	21				
4.	The NAFTA provision on taking	29				
	Table					
1.	Interaction across issues and concepts	35				



