

EN BANC

[**A.M. No. P-00-1381 and A.M. No. P-00-1382, July 31, 2001**]

JUDGE EFREN B. MALLARE, MTC-STO. DOMINGO, NUEVA ECIJA, COMPLAINANT, VS. RONALD ALLAN A. FERRY, CLERK OF COURT II, MTC - STO. DOMINGO, NUEVA ECIJA, RESPONDENT.

DECISION

PER CURIAM:

These are two (2) administrative cases filed by Judge Efren B. Mallare of the Municipal Trial Court of Sto. Domingo, Nueva Ecija, against his Clerk of Court II, respondent Ronald Allan A. Ferry.

The first, A.M. No. P-00-1381,^[1] charged respondent with **Grave Misconduct, Insubordination, Tardiness, and Non-Observance of the Eight-Hour Workday** for his alleged non-observance of regular work hours by leaving the office at 4:00 o'clock in the afternoon from 2 to 27 March 1998 and at 10:00 o'clock in the morning of 20 March 1998 without returning to office while complainant was attending a seminar in Cabanatuan City; refusal to sign the logbook; taking out from the court monthly reports of cases without permission; and, continued defiance of several memoranda issued by complainant calling respondent's attention to the foregoing infractions. Complainant likewise accused respondent of violating SC Circular No.50-95^[2] for the late deposit of a P5,000.00 cash bond received from one Yolanda Ramos on 26 February 1998, which was deposited with the Land Bank only on 10 March 1998.

In his Answer dated 27 July 1998 respondent denied any insubordination on his part and alleged that he diligently performed all his duties and responsibilities in the short time he had been appointed as Clerk of Court in December 1997 as shown by the records and technical performance of the court from January to March 1998; that although he sometimes forgot to sign the logbook it did not mean that he was tardy since he always arrived before the start of hearings and there was never any delay in the issuance of required processes; that all the Monthly Reports of Collections and of Cases from January to March 1998 were submitted to the Supreme Court on time; that he took home drafts of monthly reports to check and print them in his personal computer for better presentation; and, that the affidavits executed by his co-employees in the MTC and submitted by complainant attesting to respondent's alleged infractions were not executed voluntarily but only out of fear of complainant who is very powerful.

The second case, A.M. No. P-00-1382,^[3] charged respondent with **Grave Misconduct and Gross Dishonesty** for his failure to deposit as of 6 April 1998 the following amounts: P4,000.00 received from Aurora Gruspe on 9 March 1998 under O.R. No. 4684455; P3,000.00 received as cash bond from Rogelio Asuncion on 10

March 1998 under O.R. No. 4684456; P3,000.00 likewise received as cash bond from Michael del Rosario on 11 March 1998 under O.R. No.4684457; and, P6,000.00 received from Resty Pangilinan on 3 April 1998 under O.R. No.4684458. Complainant alleged that respondent's refusal to surrender the MTC's LBP Savings Account Passbook despite complainant's memoranda dated 7 and 15 April 1998 was in order to cover up the above misappropriations.

In his Affidavit-Answer dated 9 June 1998 respondent alleged that he did not comply with complainant's directive for him to surrender the LBP Passbook and all accountable forms because the order was irregular, illegal and a clear manifestation of abuse of authority; that the P16,000.00 mentioned by complainant in his affidavit-complaint was duly deposited on 5 May 1998 as shown by the LBP Passbook; that he did not immediately deposit the cash received by him since it was not practical to travel everyday twenty (20) kilometers more or less from the MTC to the Land Bank, Talavera Branch. He instead maintained ready cash for reimbursement to save time, effort and gasoline. Finally, respondent alleged that complainant's accusation that he misappropriated the amounts mentioned in the affidavit-complaint was baseless and borne out of complainant's desire to replace him in his position with somebody else.

Subsequently, on 30 September 1998 complainant informed the Court of his recent discovery of a malversation by respondent of the amount of P1,040.00 covered by Check No. CC 0000000448 dated 6 April 1998 issued by the Land Bank of the Philippines in payment of its filing fees in Civil Case Nos. 1589 to 1596, *Land Bank of the Philippines v. Ricardo Sobrepena, et al.*

On 5 April 2000 we referred these cases to the executive Judge of the RTC, Sto. Domingo, Nueva Ecija, for investigation, report and recommendation within sixty (60) days from receipt.

In her Investigation Report dated 22 August 2000 Executive Judge Cholita B. Santos recommended that respondent be dismissed from the service on the basis of the following findings-

Evidence in support of the charges for grave misconduct, insubordination, tardiness, non-observance of the 8-hour work day and violation of SC Circular and dishonesty against the respondent x x x shows that **as early as January 7, 1998; January 23,1998; January 27,1998; March 17,1998; and March 30, 1998** (Exhibits BB, CC, DD, EE and B, respectively), **complainant Judge Efren B. Mallare had issued memorandum (sic) as guidelines and orders for his newly appointed Clerk of Court, the herein respondent, for the latter to follow like the non-bringing out of records, wearing a uniform, attending to (sic) the flag raising ceremonies, observance of the 8-hour work a (sic) day. Despite receipt of all these memoranda, respondent defied them** by his failure to attend the flag raising ceremonies as certified by Mr. Arsenio Valdez, SB Secretary of Sto. Domingo, Nueva Ecija as well as by the testimonies of Rufino Duque and Mary Noveras, Court Interpreter and Clerk of Court Designate, respectively, of the Municipal Trial Court of Sto. Domingo, Nueva Ecija who executed their respective affidavits (Exhibits D to D-2 and E to E-2) as well as the joint affidavits of Mr. Duque and Mrs. Noveras with their

other co-employees (Exhibits W to W-8), the joint affidavits of Evelyn Ragel, Marivic Ragel and Nonilo Alejo (Exhibits F to F-4) and the affidavit of Nestor Natividad (Exhibits G to G-2). Respondent's failure to sign the logbook is evidenced by the court's logbook for March 1998 (Exhibits X to X-5). Further evidence of his insubordination is shown by his failure to file his formal leave of absence despite the order for him to do so in the complainant's letter dated April 7, 1998 (Exhibit L) x x x x Instead of complying x x x he not only refuses to file his leave of absence but also refuses x x x up to the present to surrender to the court monies, official receipts, keys, the MTC passbook with the Land Bank of the Philippines, Talavera Branch, monthly report of cases and all properties in his possession x x x x

The respondent is also culpable of dishonesty and grave misconduct x x x as shown by the testimonies of Mary Noveras, Rizza Carlos and Lorinda Vilorio. The respondent who is an accountable officer and clothed with authority to collect and receive fees pursuant to the Rules of Court had received from the Land Bank of the Philippines, Talavera Branch, the amount of P1,040.00 represented by Cashier's Check No. 0000000448 dated April 6, 1998 (Exhibit I) to cover filing fees; JDF in the amount of P480.00 under O.R. No.9274019 (Exhibit J); GF for P480.00 under O.R. No. 1929459 (Exhibit J-1) and the amount of P80.00 as LRF under O.R. No. 3037829 (Exhibit J-2), respectively. **Despite receipt of these amounts in the total of P1,040.00 x x x from the Land Bank of the Philippines, Talavera Branch in payment of these fees in Civil Case Nos. 1589 to 1596 entitled Land Bank of the Philippines versus Ricardo Sobrepena, et al. x x x the respondent never deposited the amount x x x to (sic) the depository bank, the Land Bank of the Philippines, Talavera Branch as this amount is never reflected in the MTC passbook (Exhibit GG). Instead, x x x respondent used the check for his own personal use to pay his loan to a neighbor named Chato whose real name is Glenda Geronimo and this Chato in turn paid the check to a grocery store owned by a valued client of Solid Bank, Cabanatuan City Branch and this valued client was the one who negotiated and deposited the check at Solid Bank.**

These facts were reported to the Court Administrator by the complainant on September 30, 1998 (Exhibits HH to HH-1) wherein a copy of the complainant's inquiry dated August 26, 1998 on how the check was encashed to the Solid Bank was made from the manager of the Solid Bank (Exhibit II). In the answer of the Solid Bank dated September 21, 1998 (Exhibit JJ), it appears that the name Chato appearing therein is one Glenda Geronimo x x x x Up to the present, respondent had not restituted this P1,040.00 to the court to the damage of the judiciary x x x x

Respondent had (sic) also violated SC Circular No. 50- 95, par. 4(b) dated October 11, 1995 in (sic) not depositing the Fiduciary Fund within twenty-four (24) hours from receipt because an amount of P5,000.00 x x x received by him on February 26, 1998 as bailbond paid by one Yolanda Ramos under O.R. No. 4684453