

SECOND DIVISION

[G.R. No. 215705-07, February 22, 2017]

COMMISSIONER OF INTERNAL REVENUE AND COMMISSIONER OF CUSTOMS, PETITIONERS, VS. PHILIPPINE AIRLINES, INC., RESPONDENT.

D E C I S I O N

PERALTA, J.:

Before the Court is a petition for review on *certiorari* seeking the reversal and setting aside of the Decision^[1] and Resolution^[2] of the Court of Tax Appeals (CTA) *En Banc*, dated April 30, 2014 and December 16, 2014, respectively, in CTA EB Nos. 1029, 1031 and 1032. The assailed judgment affirmed the January 17, 2013 Decision^[3] and June 4, 2013 Resolution^[4] of the CTA Special 2nd Division in CTA Case No. 8153.

The controversy in the instant case, which gave rise to the present petition for review on *certiorari*, revolves around the interpretation of the provisions of Presidential Decree No. 1590 (*PD 1590*), otherwise known as "An Act Granting a New Franchise to Philippine Airlines, Inc. to Establish, Operate, and Maintain Air Transport Services in the Philippines and Other Countries" *vis-a-vis* Republic Act No. 9334 (*RA 9334*), otherwise known as "An Act Increasing the Excise Tax Rates Imposed on Alcohol and Tobacco Products, Amending for the Purpose Sections 131, 141, 142, 145, and 228 of the National Internal Revenue Code of 1997." *PD 1590* was enacted on June 11, 1978, while *RA 9334* took effect on January 1, 2005.

Prior to the effectivity of *RA 9334*, Republic Act No. 8424 (*RA 8424*), otherwise known as the "Tax Reform Act of 1997," was enacted and took effect on January 1, 1998, thereby amending the National Internal Revenue Code (NIRC). Section 131 of the NIRC, as amended by *RA 8424*, provides:

SEC. 131. *Payment of Excise Taxes on Imported Articles. -*

(A) Persons Liable. — Excise taxes on imported articles shall be paid by the owner or importer to the Customs Officers, conformably with the regulations of the Department of Finance and before the release of such articles from the customs house, or by the person who is found in possession of articles which are exempt from excise taxes other than those legally entitled to exemption.

In the case of tax-free articles brought or imported into the Philippines by persons, entities, or agencies exempt from tax which are subsequently sold, transferred or exchanged in the Philippines to non-exempt persons or entities, the purchasers or recipients shall be considered the importers thereof, and shall be liable for the duty and internal revenue tax due on

such importation.

The provision of any special or general law to the contrary notwithstanding, the importation of cigars and cigarettes, distilled spirits and wines into the Philippines, even if destined for tax and duty free shops, shall be subject to all applicable taxes, duties, charges, including excise taxes due thereon: *Provided, however,* That this shall not apply to cigars and cigarettes, distilled spirits and wines brought directly into the duly chartered or legislated freeports of the Subic Special Economic and Freeport Zone, crated under Republic Act No. 7227; the Cagayan Special Economic Zone and Freeport, created under Republic Act No. 7922; and the Zamboanga City Special Economic Zone, created under Republic Act No. 7903, and are not transshipped to any other port in the Philippines: *Provided, further,* That importations of cigars and cigarettes, distilled spirits and wines by a government-owned and operated duty-free shop, like the Duty-Free Philippines (DFP), shall be exempted from all applicable taxes, duties, charges, including excise tax due thereon: *Provided, still further,* That if such articles directly imported by a government-owned and operated duty-free shop like the Duty-Free Philippines, shall be labeled "*tax and duty-free*" and "*not for resale*": *Provided, still further,* That is such articles brought into the duly chartered or legislated freeports under Republic Acts No. 7227, 7922 and 7903 are subsequently introduced into the Philippine customs territory, then such articles shall, upon such introduction, be deemed imported into the Philippines and shall be subject to all imposts and excise taxes provided herein and other statutes: *Provided, finally,* That the removal and transfer of tax and duty-free goods, products, machinery, equipment and other similar articles, from one freeport to another freeport, shall not be deemed an introduction into the Philippine customs territory.

Articles confiscated shall be disposed of in accordance with the rules and regulations to be promulgated by the Secretary of Finance, upon recommendation of the Commissioner of Customs and Internal Revenue, upon consultation with the Secretary of Tourism and the General manager of the Philippine Tourism Authority.

The tax due on any such goods, products, machinery, equipment or other similar articles shall constitute a lien on the article itself, and such lien shall be superior to all other charges or liens, irrespective of the possessor thereof.

(B) *Rate and Basis of the Excise Tax on Imported Articles.* - Unless otherwise specified imported articles shall be subject to the same rates and basis of excise taxes applicable to locally manufactured articles.^[5]

On January 1, 2005, RA 9334 took effect, Section 6 of which amended the abovequoted Section 131 of the NIRC and, accordingly, reads as follows:

SEC. 131. *Payment of Excise Taxes on Imported Articles.* -

(A) *Persons Liable.* - Excise taxes on imported articles shall be paid by the owner or importer to the Customs Officers, conformably with the regulations of the Department of Finance and before the release of such articles from the customs house, or by the person who is found in possession of articles which are exempt from excise taxes other than those legally entitled to exemption.

"In the case of tax-free articles brought or imported into the Philippines by persons, entities, or agencies exempt from tax which are subsequently sold, transferred or exchanged in the Philippines to non-exempt persons or entities, the purchasers or recipients shall be considered the importers thereof, and shall be liable for the duty and internal revenue tax due on such importation.

"The provision of any special or general law to the contrary notwithstanding, the importation of cigars and cigarettes, distilled spirits, fermented liquors and wines into the Philippines, even if destined for tax and duty-free shops, shall be subject to all applicable taxes, duties, charges, including excise taxes due thereon. This shall apply to cigars and cigarettes, distilled spirits, fermented liquors and wines brought directly into the duly chartered or legislated freeports of the Subic Special Economic and Freeport Zone, created under Republic Act No. 7227; the Cagayan Special Economic Zone and Freeport, created under Republic Act No. 7922; and the Zamboanga City Special Economic Zone, created under Republic Act No. 7903, and such other freeports as may hereafter be established or created by law: Provided, further, That importations of cigars and cigarettes, distilled spirits, fermented liquors and wines made directly by a government-owned and operated duty-free shop, like the Duty-Free Philippines (DFP), shall be exempted from all applicable duties only: Provided, still further, That such articles directly imported by a government-owned and operated duty-free shop, like the Duty-Free Philippines, shall be labeled 'duty-free' and 'not for resale': Provided, finally, That the removal and transfer of tax and duty-free goods, products, machinery, equipment and other similar articles other than cigars and cigarettes, distilled spirits, fermented liquors and wines, from one freeport to another freeport, shall not be deemed an introduction into the Philippine customs territory."

"Cigars and cigarettes, distilled spirits and wines within the premises of all duty-free shops which are not labelled as hereinabove required, as well as tax and duty-free articles obtained from a duty-free shop and subsequently found in a non-duty-free shop to be offered for resale shall be confiscated, and the perpetrator of such non-labelling or re-selling shall be punishable under the applicable provisions of this Code.

"Articles confiscated shall be disposed of in accordance with the rules and regulations to be promulgated by the Secretary of Finance, upon recommendation of the Commissioners of Customs and Internal Revenue, upon consultation with the Secretary of Tourism and the General Manager of the Philippine Tourism Authority.

"The tax due on any such goods, products, machinery, equipment or other similar articles shall constitute a lien on the article itself, and such lien shall be superior to all other charges or liens, irrespective of the possessor thereof.

"(B) *Rate and Basis of the Excise Tax on Imported Articles.* - Unless otherwise specified, imported articles shall be subject to the same rates and basis of excise taxes applicable to locally manufactured articles."^[6]

The amendment increased the rates of excise tax imposed on alcohol and tobacco products. It also removed the exemption from taxes, duties and charges, including excise taxes, on importations of cigars, cigarettes, distilled spirits, wines and fermented liquor into the Philippines.

Thereafter, PAL's importations of alcohol and tobacco products which were intended for use in its commissary supplies during international flights, were subjected to excise taxes. For the said imported articles, which arrived in Manila between October 3, 2007 and December 22, 2007, PAL was assessed excise taxes amounting to a total of P6,329,735.21.

On September 5, 2008, PAL paid under protest. On March 5, 2009, PAL filed an administrative claim for refund of the above excise taxes it paid with the Bureau of Internal Revenue (*BIR*) contending that it is entitled to tax privileges under Section 13 of PD 1590, which provides as follows:

Section 13. In consideration of the franchise and rights hereby granted, the grantee shall pay to the Philippine Government during the life of this franchise whichever of subsections (a) and (b) hereunder will result in a lower tax:

(a) The basic corporate income tax based on the grantee's annual net taxable income computed in accordance with the provisions of the National Internal Revenue Code; or

(b) A franchise tax of two per cent (2%) of the gross revenues derived by the grantee from all sources, without distinction as to transport or nontransport operations; provided, that with respect to international air-transport service, only the gross passenger, mail, and freight revenues from its outgoing flights shall be subject to this tax.

The tax paid by the grantee under either of the above alternatives shall be in lieu of all other taxes, duties, royalties, registration, license, and other fees and charges of any kind, nature, or description, imposed, levied, established, assessed, or collected by any municipal, city, provincial, or national authority or government agency, now or in the future, including but not limited to the following:

1. All taxes, duties, charges, royalties, or fees due on local purchases by the grantee of aviation gas, fuel, and oil, whether refined or in crude form, and whether such taxes, duties, charges, royalties, or fees are directly due from or imposable upon the purchaser or the seller, producer, manufacturer, or importer of said petroleum products but are billed or passed on the grantee either as part of the price or cost thereof or by mutual agreement or other arrangement; provided, that all such purchases by, sales or deliveries of aviation gas, fuel, and oil to the grantee shall be for exclusive use in its transport and nontransport operations and other activities incidental thereto;

2. All taxes, including compensating taxes, duties, charges, royalties, or fees due on all importations by the grantee of aircraft, engines, equipment, machinery, spare parts, accessories, commissary and catering supplies, aviation gas, fuel, and oil, whether refined or in crude form and other articles, supplies, or materials; provided, that such articles or supplies or materials are imported for the use of the grantee in its transport and transport operations and other activities incidental thereto and are not locally available in reasonable quantity, quality, or price;

3. All taxes on lease rentals, interest, fees, and other charges payable to lessors, whether foreign or domestic, of aircraft, engines, equipment, machinery, spare parts, and other property rented, leased, or chartered by the grantee where the payment of such taxes is assumed by the grantee;

4. All taxes on interest, fees, and other charges on foreign loans obtained and other obligations incurred by the grantee where the payment of such taxes is assumed by the grantee;

5. All taxes, fees, and other charges on the registration, licensing, acquisition, and transfer of aircraft, equipment, motor vehicles, and all other personal and real property of the grantee; and

6. The corporate development tax under Presidential Decree No. 1158-A.

The grantee, shall, however, pay the tax on its real property in conformity with existing law.

For purposes of computing the basic corporate income tax as provided herein, the grantee is authorized:

(a) To depreciate its assets to the extent of not more than twice as fast the normal rate of depreciation; and