

THIRD DIVISION

[G.R. Nos. 92271-72, April 01, 1996]

**PEOPLE OF THE PHILIPPINES, PLAINTIFF-APPELLEE, VS.
SALVADOR CARITATIVO, ET AL., ACCUSED-APPELLANTS.**

D E C I S I O N

PANGANIBAN, J.:

In deciding this appeal, the Court finds occasion to reiterate some well-settled doctrines in determining the guilt of the accused, particularly in appreciating treachery as a qualifying circumstance in the crime of murder.

This is an appeal from the twin decisions^[1] dated April 13, 1989 of the Regional Trial Court of Iloilo City, 6th Judicial Region, Branch 33 convicting accused Salvador Caritativo and Victor Solas of the crime of murder and sentencing them to *reclusion perpetua*.

The victims were Fred (Wilfredo) Pama and his eleven-year-old son Joey; the man succumbed to (4) stab wounds and one gunshot wound, while the boy died from three (3) incised wounds and eleven (11) stab wounds. Another son, Jeffrey, lived to recount the tale of horror only because he managed to escape from the scene of the killings and hide in nearby ricefields.

Witnesses disclosed to police the identities of the perpetrators: Salvador Caritativo, Victor Solas and Gregorio (Gogoy) Solomon. The first two were arrested, but Solomon fled and remained at large. Thus, only Caritativo and Solas were charged in two (2) Informations - one for the slaying of Joey Pama, docketed as Criminal Case No. 18986, and the other for the killing of Fred Pama, docketed as Criminal Case No. 18987.

The first-mentioned Information reads as follows:

"That on or about April 6, 1984, in the municipality of Dueñas, province of Iloilo, Philippines, and within the jurisdiction of this Court, the abovenamed accused, conspiring, confederating and working together with Gregorio Solomon, who is still at large, armed with knives, with treachery and evident premeditation, and with deliberate intent and decided purpose to kill, did then and there willfully, unlawfully and feloniously attack, assault and stab one Joey Pama with weapons with which they were then provided, thereby inflicting upon the latter stab wounds (sic) on the vital parts of his body which caused his death thereafter.

CONTRARY TO LAW."^[2]

The other information is similarly worded except for the name of the victim which was changed to Fred Pama.^[3]

Arraigned on September 3, 1985, both accused, assisted by counsel *de officio*, pleaded "not guilty."^[4] Thereafter, joint trial was held in these two cases.

The Facts of the Case

According to the Prosecution

The prosecution's version of what transpired as culled from the testimonies of the prosecution witnesses is as follows:

On April 6, 1984 at around 8:00 o'clock in the morning, Wenifreda Pama together with her two sons, Joey and Jeffrey, went to a birthday party at the house of Ofelia Caritativo, Salvador Caritativo, brother of Ofelia, and Victor Solas, his first cousin, were also living in the same house. After having lunch, Joey and Jeffrey went home while Wenifreda stayed behind and helped wash the dishes. At around 2:00 p.m., Wenifreda joined Salvador, Victor and Gregorio alias Gogoy in drinking "tuba" and a native white wine called "biti-biti." After drinking, she helped in cooking merienda, and then left for home late in the afternoon.^[5]

Meanwhile, worried that it was getting dark and his wife was not yet home, Fred Pama, husband of Wenifreda, together with his sons Joey and Jeffrey, rode on their carabao to the house of Ofelia to fetch Wenifreda: Along the way, they met and were suddenly waylaid ("Ginsulang kami") by Salvador Caritativo, Victor Solas and Gregorio (Gogoy) Solomon. Solomon stabbed Fred but missed, hitting the carabao instead. Injured, the beast bolted, and the three riders were thrown off. Jeffrey was able to run away. While running, he looked back and saw Solomon stabbing his father Fred, and Caritativo and Solas holding Joey and stabbing him. Jeffrey then hid behind the ricefield dike, from where he heard two gunshots.^[6] He remained hidden there the whole night and went home early the following morning. He then related the incident to his mother.^[7]

Fely Gonzales, elder sister of Fred Pama, testified that at around 6:30 in the afternoon of April 6, 1984, she was with her five-year-old son walking home towards Barangay Sto. Niño from Barangay Angari (an adjacent barrio). Suddenly, she heard the voice of her nephew Joey shouting for help. She immediately proceeded to the place where the voice came from. At a distance of around 20 meters, she saw Solas, Caritativo and Solomon stabbing her brother Fred and nephew Joey. She wanted to help them but was afraid for her own life. She hid herself beside the rice paddy with mora grasses and silently cried until after the killings. When the three left, she approached the scene of the murders, and after ascertaining that Fred and Joey were already dead, she went home. She didn't tell her husband about the incident for fear that the latter and his relatives will go after the culprits.^[8]

In the early morning of April 7, 1984, the dead bodies of Fred and Joey were recovered. The autopsy conducted on the body of Fred Pama revealed that he sustained four (4) stab wounds and a gunshot wound. On the other hand, Joey

Pama suffered three (3) incised wounds and eleven (11) stab wounds.^[9]

According to the Defense

In contrast to the prosecution's theory that Caritativo, Solas and Solomon "conspired, confederated, and helped one another with treachery and evident premeditation kill Fred Pama and x x x Joey Pama," the accused contend that "it was only Gregorio Solomon who perpetrated both killings laying the blame on Gregorio Solomon alone who has conveniently disappeared to defeat the ends of justice."^[10] Their version of the events is as follows:

On April 5, 1984 while Ofelia Caritativo and Wenifreda Pama were weeding the grass in a sugarcane field, Ofelia invited Wenifreda to have lunch at her house the following day, April 6, as it was the birthday of her daughter. At around 11:00 the following morning, Wenifreda arrived at Ofelia's house and shortly thereafter was followed by her sons Joey and Jeffrey. Aside from themselves there were other invited guests, mostly relatives of Ofelia.

After lunch, Joey and Jeffrey went home, while Wenifreda stayed behind. Victor Solas and Salvador Caritativo together with their uncles and cousins were drinking "tuba" and, later, whiskey. Gregorio Solomon who was present also joined in the drinking, as did Wenifreda. Drunk after partaking of "tuba" and whiskey, Wenifreda started dancing with Gregorio. While dancing Gregorio would kiss Wenifreda. Seeing this, Salvador allowed (encouraged) them to leave because he did not want his sisters to witness such behavior.

Wenifreda, accompanied by Gregorio who had not drunk as much, left before 6:00 o'clock that afternoon. After they had gone, Salvador and his cousins continued their Storytelling. When they were preparing to go to bed around 6:30 that evening, Salvador heard Gregorio calling his name. He went down whereupon Gregorio told him that he had stabbed Fred and Joey Pama. When Salvador asked him why, Gregorio replied that on their way to Wenifreda's house, they met Fred who saw Wenifreda holding him (Gregorio); Fred reacted by hacking him, so he stabbed Fred and his son. After relating this to Salvador, Gregorio left. Fearing a reprisal, Salvador told his sister Ofelia to forthwith transfer to their aunt's house as the family of the deceased might suspect that they were responsible for the killings. After that, Salvador together with Victor went to Gil Catalan, the Barangay Captain of Barangay Sto. Niño, to report the incident; however, the latter was in Barangay Angari attending the fiesta. Salvador then informed Vilma Catalan, wife of Gil, that Gregorio was responsible for the killings.

On April 9, 1984, Vilma sent a telegram to Gregorio's father Gorgonio, who was in Dadiangas, General Santos, to inform him of his son's crime. Gorgonio returned to Dueñas on April 15, and was promptly informed by his children and mother-in-law of the tragic and dastardly deed. Subsequently, on September 30, 1984, Gorgonio was able to talk to his son when the latter returned home. Asked where he was hiding, Gregorio told his father that he hid in the mountains, and again admitted that he slew Fred and Joey. Gorgonio insisted that he give himself up but the latter refused and instead fled. They met again in March 1985 in the mountains of Pughanan, Lambunao when the former went there. After that meeting, he lost contact with his

son.

The Trial Court's Ruling

On April 13, 1989, the trial court rendered two separate decisions convicting Caritativo and Solas for two counts of murder. The dispositive portion of the decision in Criminal Case No. 18986 reads as follows:

"WHEREFORE, in view of the foregoing, the guilt of both accused Salvador Caritativo and Victor Solas having been proved beyond reasonable doubt for the killing of Joey Pama, the accused are hereby sentenced to suffer the penalty of reclusion perpetua.

The accused Salvador Caritativo and Victor Solas are hereby jointly (and) severally ordered to pay the heirs of Joey Pama the sum of P30,000.00 for the death of Joey Pama.

SO ORDERED."^[11]

The dispositive portion of the decision in the other case is the same except that the name of the victim was changed to Fred Pama.

In their appeal brief, both accused raised a lone assignment of error, to wit:

"THE HONORABLE TRIAL COURT, BRANCH XXXIII REGIONAL TRIAL COURT, SIXTH JUDICIAL REGION, ERRED IN CONVICTING THE TWO ACCUSED ON THE BASIS PRINCIPALLY OF THE EVIDENCE FOR THE PROSECUTION."

This Court's Ruling

In effect, the defense contends that the trial court did not give credence to the testimonies of their witnesses, nor to their theory which consists mainly in avoidance and alibi. However, such argument deserves little if any consideration.

Firstly, as pointed out by the Solicitor General, the desperate attempt of the accused to hide behind their alibi cannot prevail over the positive identification made by the eyewitnesses at the scene of the crime, *viz.*, Jeffrey Pama and Fely Gonzales, that the accused were among the assailants of the deceased. The following excerpts from the transcripts of stenographic notes will drive home the point:

(Prosecution witness Fely Gonzales testifying)

- Q** Please tell the court why you were not able to go to the very place where Joey Pama was?
- A** When I heard his voice I approached near the place where they were situated.
- Q** Whom did you see?
- A** I saw Victor, Salvador and another person by the name of Gregorio Solomon.
- Q** Now, that Salvador and Victor that you saw where (are) they now?